

Kirtland Community College

HLC ID 1885

STANDARD PATHWAY: Mid-Cycle Review

Review Date: 9/13/2021

Dr. Thomas Quinn
President

Linnea Stenson
HLC Liaison

Robert Haas
Review Team Chair

Shannon Jesme
Team Member

Anne Kamps
Team Member

Kelli Sinclair
Team Member

Gary Yarbrough
Team Member

Context and Nature of Review

Review Date

9/13/2021

Mid-Cycle Reviews include:

- The Year 4 Review in the Open and Standard Pathways
- The Biennial Review for Applying institutions

Reaffirmation Reviews include:

- The Year 10 Review in the Open and Standard Pathways
- The Review for Initial Candidacy for Applying institutions
- The Review for Initial Accreditation for Applying institutions
- The Year 4 Review for Standard Pathway institutions that are in their first accreditation cycle after attaining initial accreditation

Scope of Review

- Mid-Cycle Review
- Federal Compliance (if applicable)
- On-site Visit

- 2021–22 COVID-19 Response Form

Institutional Context

Kirtland Community College was established in 1966 by a vote of the citizens of the COOR (Crawford, Ogemaw, Oscoda, Roscommon) Intermediate School District. Kirtland is one of 28 public community colleges in Michigan. Each college is autonomous, governed by a seven-member elected board of trustees. Kirtland's official service district is 2500 square miles; it is the largest area of all Michigan Community colleges. The population of the area is just under 70,000. The poverty rate is higher than the rate for the state and the college degree attainment rate is lower than the state average.

Kirtland is completing a major building project in Grayling and is the final phase of consolidating three campus locations to two locations (Grayling and Gaylord). This will result in substantial operational cost savings with minimal impact to program offerings. Kirtland plans to construct on-campus residence halls at the Grayling campus to provide housing for students. Kirtland students reside in over 170 zip codes and have expressed concern about a lack of adequate housing.

Kirtland has been recognized as an outstanding online education provider and has equipped its classrooms with technology to facilitate online learning. Kirtland has also purposefully designed course schedules (e.g creating blocked courses for programs) to minimize travel to campus where possible.

Kirtland is a mission-driven college with strong ties to its community and a clear vision.

Interactions with Constituencies

The team met with the following constituencies (unique persons):

Academic Advisor (3)
Accounts Payable (1)
Admissions (1)
Adult interest art student (1)
ALO/IR Director (1)
Assistant Registrar (1)
Associate Director/HR (1)
Associate Registrar (1)
AuSable Artisan Village Director(1)
COOR Superintendent (1)
COOR/ISO Adjunct, KRPA Advisory Board (1)
Dean-Health Sciences (1)
Dean-SVSU (1)
Director-Academic Support (1)
Director-CJ (1)
Director-CTL and Academic Technology (1)
Director-Facilities (1)
Director-Finance (1)
Director-Financial Aid (1)
Director-IT (1)
Director-Library Services (1)
Director-Surg Tech (1)
Director-Web Services (1)
Faculty-CAD and Graphic Design (1)
Faculty-English (3)
Faculty-History (1)
Faculty-Nursing (2)
Faculty-Science (1)
Faculty-Speech/Comm (1)
Faculty-SVSU (1)
Financial Aid Advisor (1)
Houghton Lake HS Assistant Principal (1)
Houghton Lake HS Counselor (1)
IT Support (2)
Kirtland Foundation Board Member (1)
Maintenance II (1)
Students (11)
President (1)
Public Safety (1)
Reference Librarian (1)
RN-BSN Coordinator-SVSU (1)
Student Financial Services Supervisor (1)
Testing Center Specialist (1)
Trustee (3, Including Chair, Vice-Chair)
VP Academics (1)

VP Business Services (1)
VP/CNO Grayling Munson Hospital (1)
VP-Student Services (1)

The team held the following meetings:

President
Leadership Team
Assurance Writing Team
Criterion 1&2 Open Forum
Criterion 3 Open Forum
Criterion 4 Open Forum
Criterion 5 Open Forum
Assessment Committee
I/R Committee
HR - Faculty Qualifications Review
VP Business Affairs (CFO)
Strategic Planning Committee
Faculty - Open Forum - Open Forum
Staff - Open Forum
Students - Open Forum
Distance Learning/Curriculum Committee
Board of Trustees (3 board members present)
Community Meeting (11 community members present)

Additional Documents

We requested and received these additional documents:

- Copies of fall 2021 syllabi
- List of committee memberships

We reviewed these additional documents/sites:

- IPEDS Website
- Kirtland Website
- Campus Posters / Flyers

1 - Mission

The institution's mission is clear and articulated publicly; it guides the institution's operations.

1.A - Core Component 1.A

The institution's mission is articulated publicly and operationalized throughout the institution.

1. The mission was developed through a process suited to the context of the institution.
2. The mission and related statements are current and reference the institution's emphasis on the various aspects of its mission, such as instruction, scholarship, research, application of research, creative works, clinical service, public service, economic development and religious or cultural purpose.
3. The mission and related statements identify the nature, scope and intended constituents of the higher education offerings and services the institution provides.
4. The institution's academic offerings, student support services and enrollment profile are consistent with its stated mission.
5. The institution clearly articulates its mission through public information, such as statements of purpose, vision, values, goals, plans or institutional priorities.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland developed its current mission in 2014 and affirmed it in 2019. The strategic plan is updated every five years, and the mission is reviewed during the strategic plan update. Kirtland's Operational Plan is updated each year and is used as problem-solving document to adjust for current conditions. Kirtland involves an employee team for the review; the team proposes changes to the administrative team, receives input from the board of trustees, and presents updates to the College employees. The site visit team confirmed employee and other stakeholder involvement during the site visit meetings.

Kirtland's mission documents include statements of purpose that guide the College's operations. Kirtland has strong focus on occupational programs that will enhance the local community and improve the educational attainment of local citizens.

Kirtland's mission documents include values and purpose statements that identify the College's constituents, offerings, and services. An economic impact report published in September 2019 shows that Kirtland supports 912 jobs in the College's service area, or 1 out of every 69 jobs.

Kirtland's Mission, Vision, and Values statements are clearly displayed on the College's website, its Strategic Plan, and in various publications. The mission and vision statements are included on business cards, and the mission, vision, and values statements are displayed in a variety of rooms

across campus.

Kirtland's academic offerings are aligned with the needs of the 2500 sq. mile Kirtland service area. Kirtland was a key partner in attracting a large particle board manufacturer to the area by developing a training program for the workforce the manufacturer needed. To date, approximately 230 new jobs have been created, with a goal of 500 jobs when the new plant is in full production. Community and business stakeholders cited Kirtland's involvement in local cultural initiatives and Kirtland's health care programs as key evidence of Kirtland's responsiveness to local needs.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.B - Core Component 1.B

The institution's mission demonstrates commitment to the public good.

1. The institution's actions and decisions demonstrate that its educational role is to serve the public, not solely the institution or any superordinate entity.
2. The institution's educational responsibilities take primacy over other purposes, such as generating financial returns for investors, contributing to a related or parent organization, or supporting external interests.
3. The institution engages with its external constituencies and responds to their needs as its mission and capacity allow.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland has identified four primary external stakeholders through its strategic planning process: Community, Government, Education, and Organizations/Agencies. The College has outlined a plan to engage each of these constituencies in planning and program development.

Kirtland is a public community college dedicated to building stronger communities and enhancing student lives. One example of Kirtland's commitment to the area is demonstrated by the College's 2019 Facilities Master Plan, which outlines renovations to existing buildings and a recently constructed new building just a few miles south of Grayling, Michigan.

An economic analysis prepared by EMSI concluded that Kirtland added \$63 million in income to the College service area's economy. Kirtland created a Wood Technology and Wood Machine Operation Certificate in 2018 to improve service to the wood manufacturers and producers in the area. The College partners with Redken for its Cosmetology program. Kirtland was a key partner in creating a downtown Grayling Arts Center that provides an outlet for local artisans to market their goods and sponsors cultural events such as theater and music.

Kirtland has a Milo Range system that provides a way to interactively train peace officers. Kirtland's Criminal Justice program faculty provide training for natural resources, police, and corrections officers throughout the state of Michigan.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.C - Core Component 1.C

The institution provides opportunities for civic engagement in a diverse, multicultural society and globally connected world, as appropriate within its mission and for the constituencies it serves.

1. The institution encourages curricular or cocurricular activities that prepare students for informed citizenship and workplace success.
2. The institution's processes and activities demonstrate inclusive and equitable treatment of diverse populations.
3. The institution fosters a climate of respect among all students, faculty, staff and administrators from a range of diverse backgrounds, ideas and perspectives.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Although Kirtland is a commuter campus, the College provides some extra-curricular and co-curricular activities. However, student interest is limited as most students are either working and/or caring for children or aging parents.

Kirtland offers three intercollegiate sports, Phi Theta Kappa, a Student Veterans of America club, and student organizations related to specific programs. The College is exploring implementing a study abroad program and adding extra-curricular activities such as basketball. Kirtland sponsors Community Art Shows and encourages students to participate in local projects such as Habitat for Humanity. Kirtland is considering its co-curricular activity offerings, possibly moving to an "inter-curricular" model where community-based activities are incorporated in course design.

Kirtland's five-county service area is not ethnically diverse but is economically diverse. Kirtland updated its core competencies in 2018 to address different types of diversity and has appropriate policies in place to promote equal opportunities for employees and students. It was evident to the site visit team that Kirtland fosters a climate of respect for persons of diverse backgrounds and perspectives, especially economic and "first-generation-in-college" diversity. At some point, Kirtland might consider adding additional ideas about addressing gender diversity in its processes and activities.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.S - Criterion 1 - Summary

The institution's mission is clear and articulated publicly; it guides the institution's operations.

Rationale

Kirtland's mission is clear and publicly articulated through a variety of print and online publications. The College is guided by its mission - "To provide innovative educational opportunities to enhance student lives and build stronger communities and by its Vision - "Kirtland will be the first choice for learner-centered education guiding students and communities toward success."

The best example of evidence supporting Kirtland's fulfillment of Criterion 1 is the College's new building in Grayling, Michigan. Kirtland's administrative team designed the building with state-of-the-art classrooms, including:

- Sonography lab equipped to support a sonography program that attracts students from across the state
- Automotive lab that serves as a training center for Daimler/Chrysler
- Nursing simulators
- Anamotage tables (virtual dissection)
- Cosmetology Lab (designed in conjunction with Redken)
- Wood Products Technology Lab
- Classrooms equipped for broadcast lectures

Construction of the new Grayling building was a part of a comprehensive strategic plan aligned with Kirtland's mission.

2 - Integrity: Ethical and Responsible Conduct

The institution acts with integrity; its conduct is ethical and responsible.

2.A - Core Component 2.A

The institution establishes and follows policies and processes to ensure fair and ethical behavior on the part of its governing board, administration, faculty and staff.

1. The institution develops and the governing board adopts the mission.
2. The institution operates with integrity in its financial, academic, human resources and auxiliary functions.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland Community College has developed, and the governing board has adopted, a responsible mission with a central focus on innovative educational opportunities that enhance student lives and build strong communities. The College's current mission statement was developed with stakeholder input in 2014 and reviewed in 2019. The Site Review Team discussions provided affirming evidence to suggest the College's board members recognize and promote the mission of the institution. One board member stated, "The strategic plan gives a broad map to help us fulfill the mission of the college." In 2019, the Board of Trustees (BOT) along with a team consisting of internal and external stakeholders completed an appreciative inquiry process resulting in the current strategic direction plan (2019-2024). During interviews board members shared comments demonstrating commitment to strengthening the college and the community.

Kirtland operates with integrity in its financial, academic, human resource, and auxiliary functions. With respect to finances, the College practices are aligned with government auditing standards and professional internal auditing practices to ensure oversight and accountability of expenditures. Major capital repairs and improvements come out of facility planning and the College has budgeted for planned expenses. The College budgets for routine repairs and maintenance, with large, unexpected expenses to come out of fund balance or by making adjustments to current departmental budgets. The new construction eliminated much of the deferred maintenance backlog as the Roscommon site which was over 50 years old was replaced by new construction. An added benefit is that the new construction is more energy efficient so there will be utility savings going forward.

The annual budget is presented to the public for review and approved by the Board. The board receives routine updates from the CFO during scheduled board meetings. Budget tracking software is used to administer the approval process aligned with the College Spending policy.

The College maintains a policy on academic integrity and a Code of Conduct policy that is provided to students through the student handbook, in the College online catalog, and during orientation and advising sessions. The Site Visit Team reviewed sample course syllabi affirming standardized language articulating integrity expectations. Ethical conduct is described in the faculty job dimensions, job descriptions, and in the faculty Master Agreement, describing goals and standards for conduct performance. The College has Anti-Harassment and Anti-discrimination Policies.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.B - Core Component 2.B

The institution presents itself clearly and completely to its students and to the public.

1. The institution ensures the accuracy of any representations it makes regarding academic offerings, requirements, faculty and staff, costs to students, governance structure and accreditation relationships.
2. The institution ensures evidence is available to support any claims it makes regarding its contributions to the educational experience through research, community engagement, experiential learning, religious or spiritual purpose and economic development.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland ensures accuracy of the representations it makes with respect to academic offerings, requirements, and governance structure and accreditation relationships.

For example, Kirtland's website (Student Central webpage) provides real time access to important student information including student services, online services, resources, and finances. The HLC team confirmed that Kirtland publishes information on curriculum, costs, and graduation rates on the College's Website. The HLC team also reviewed the Net Price Calculator site to confirm students are provided information regarding cost of attendance.

The College provides clear evidence to support its claim that it presents itself clearly with regard to the students' educational experience, experiential learning and community development. Kirtland maintains an accreditation webpage that includes the HLC Mark of Affiliation. A review of the Kirtland's accreditation webpage confirmed information for specialized program accreditation, licensures, 3rd party credentialing and approved curriculums for transfer are made publicly available. Programs holding specialized accreditation include current status and upcoming visit dates. The Site Visit Team verified Kirtland's Outcomes/Student Right to Know webpage provides publicly available information on students' rights and responsibilities including public records and complaint processes. The College communicates credit for prior learning options available and maintains a public webpage to support community and workforce opportunities.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.C - Core Component 2.C

The governing board of the institution is autonomous to make decisions in the best interest of the institution in compliance with board policies and to ensure the institution's integrity.

1. The governing board is trained and knowledgeable so that it makes informed decisions with respect to the institution's financial and academic policies and practices; the board meets its legal and fiduciary responsibilities.
2. The governing board's deliberations reflect priorities to preserve and enhance the institution.
3. The governing board reviews the reasonable and relevant interests of the institution's internal and external constituencies during its decision-making deliberations.
4. The governing board preserves its independence from undue influence on the part of donors, elected officials, ownership interests or other external parties.
5. The governing board delegates day-to-day management of the institution to the institution's administration and expects the institution's faculty to oversee academic matters.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland's governing board is comprised of seven elected members representing its tax district residents. Board members are oriented to responsibilities following college policy and BOT By-laws. Conversations during the site visit confirmed board members are trained and knowledgeable. The Site Visit Team affirmed the board's commitment to fulfilling the mission of the College. Board members participate in scheduled retreats, monthly board meetings, and professional development opportunities such as participation in Michigan Community College Association board member training and AACC and ACCT conferences.

The College's board discusses priorities for maintaining and developing the institution. The publicly available board agendas and minutes provide evidence of the board's monthly deliberations and affirms the board's focus on growing the institution. One major decision is how the board evaluated the Facilities Master Plan, resulting in support for the new Kirtland Grayling campus. The Site Visit Team confirmed the boards' supportive role in the relocation goals and the continued role they have to assure fiscal support exists through routine fiscal review with the CFO.

Kirtland's board preserves its independence from undue influence on the part of the donors, elected officials, and other external parties. Board members affirmed their fiscal responsibility and demonstrated their policy-making role. Board members follow the College's Standards of Good Practice; this document includes ten attributes that governing board members follow. Board members sign a conflict-of-interest statement annually.

The Site Visit Team affirmed the board delegates day-to-day institutional management to the president and his administration team and expects faculty to oversee academics. The General Duties and Responsibilities of Administrators policy articulates the activities of the president and the

president's direct reports. During the Site Visit Team's discussion, board members confirmed its practice of reviewing College KPI's, which are publicly available on the Kirtland website.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.D - Core Component 2.D

The institution is committed to academic freedom and freedom of expression in the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland is committed to academic freedom and freedom of expression in the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning. Faculty confirmed that each course has documented core objectives and that faculty oversee the development of the objectives. The College defined six designated core competencies that are assessed at the institutional level. During discussions with the Site Visit Team, faculty confirmed that all courses, regardless of delivery mode, follow the same course outcomes; faculty choose materials and have authority to determine teaching strategies that help students master the prescribed competencies. Courses designed for transfer align to the Michigan Standards of Transfer agreement.

The College has taken steps to ensure that Kirtland is a place that welcomes diverse views and perspectives via its published Freedom of Expression policy adopted in 2018. The policy states its commitment to an institution committed by law and philosophy to the principles of freedom of speech, freedom of expression, and the right to peaceably assemble.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.E - Core Component 2.E

The institution's policies and procedures call for responsible acquisition, discovery and application of knowledge by its faculty, staff and students.

1. Institutions supporting basic and applied research maintain professional standards and provide oversight ensuring regulatory compliance, ethical behavior and fiscal accountability.
2. The institution provides effective support services to ensure the integrity of research and scholarly practice conducted by its faculty, staff and students.
3. The institution provides students guidance in the ethics of research and use of information resources.
4. The institution enforces policies on academic honesty and integrity.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland maintains professional standards by ensuring regulatory compliance, ethical behavior, and fiscal accountability. The College has a Copyright Policy consistent with the United States Copyright Law of 1976 and a Copyright and Fair Use Library Guide to provide guidance. The College maintains an IRB committee made up of the Vice President of Instructional/Academic Services, the Director of Institutional Research, Kirtland's FOIA officer, and Kirtland's FERPA officer. The committee meets as needed to review requests and ensure research conducted is ethical, subjects are protected, and research complies with College standards.

The College provides guidance to students regarding ethical research and use of information resources. For example, the Code of Conduct available in the College Catalog, and the Simple Syllabus include statements that define plagiarism and encourage students to seek guidance when needed. The College provides access to a Canvas module titled *Citing Sources in 3 Easy Steps* to support students in source citing. For example, when issues of plagiarism are identified, faculty document the instance in the Maxient system, and a student can be assigned to the Canvas module for Plagiarism Traffic School as a reform support system. The College reviews data related to reported incidents of cheating, and plagiarism collected via the Maxient software system. The system is used for faculty to formally document academic misconduct and has a policy and procedure for Academic Due Process.

Kirtland has a Peer-To-Peer file sharing policy to meet the requirements of the Federal Higher Education Opportunity Act. Through the use of Canvas, the College's online learning management system, the College takes advantage of several commercially available tools to ensure academic integrity. The College uses the Respondus LockDown Browser and Monitor software to ensure academic honesty in the online environment.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.S - Criterion 2 - Summary

The institution acts with integrity; its conduct is ethical and responsible.

Rationale

Through its governing structures, policies, and fiscal management, Kirtland Community College clearly demonstrates integrity. By adhering to a commitment to policy governance, the College's board of trustees makes responsible decisions on behalf of the institution and in the public interest. The College maintains a set of practices that ensure the free and ethical pursuit of knowledge in the teaching in learning. In addition, through prudent fiscal choices and the routine monitoring of regional needs, the College assures that it manages its resources responsibly.

3 - Teaching and Learning: Quality, Resources and Support

The institution provides quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

3.A - Core Component 3.A

The rigor of the institution's academic offerings is appropriate to higher education.

1. Courses and programs are current and require levels of student performance appropriate to the credential awarded.
2. The institution articulates and differentiates learning goals for its undergraduate, graduate, post-baccalaureate, post-graduate and certificate programs.
3. The institution's program quality and learning goals are consistent across all modes of delivery and all locations (on the main campus, at additional locations, by distance delivery, as dual credit, through contractual or consortial arrangements, or any other modality).

Rating

Met

Rationale

The 2017 HLC Comprehensive Evaluation required Kirtland to submit an interim report by 12/31/2019 to address deficiencies in Core Component 3A. Specifically, the College was directed to "demonstrate progress on developing and implementing an approach to assessing student mastery of program learning outcomes, including the development of program student learning outcomes for all programs, with an articulation of the difference in learning outcomes between certificates and degrees."

In January 2018, the Kirtland faculty embarked on a large-scale review and revision of all program and course-level outcomes in occupational programs, including the delineation of differences between the certificate and degree levels. The program-level outcomes are now accessible via the College website. Certificate of Completion (CC) outcomes are distinguishable from the Degree outcomes and listed together on the web site in the program areas that offer both certificates and degrees.

General education outcomes and core competencies also were subject to a thorough review and revision. As a result of these concerted efforts, the college made significant quality improvements. The core competency for Personal Growth and Responsible Citizenship was revised to include diversity. Program outcomes for degree and certificate credentials were tagged in Canvas. Assessment of program outcomes was piloted in Winter 2019, with adoption by all faculty as of Fall 2019. The College committed to assessing competencies for each program annually, with subsequent changes made to programs based on the results of these assessments. Progress for this is addressed in Core Component 4B.

Kirtland assures that program quality and learning goals are consistent across all modes of delivery and all locations. Faculty are required to use the same Simple Syllabus template for each class section. Before teaching an online class, faculty must complete a required Canvas training and a Kirtland online orientation class in Canvas. Additionally, Kirtland has committed professional development funding each year to support faculty attainment of the Michigan state Educational Technology Online Certificate (ETOC). Several faculty members have completed this six-week credential, which includes pedagogical curriculum instruction in addition to methodology for online engagement.

Classes taught in the High School dual credit program are also subject to the syllabus and online standards. With rare exception, dual credit and early college classes are taught by Kirtland instructors, even those located on site at the high schools. Kirtland will not allow a class to run as dual credit unless Kirtland has assured the qualifications of the high school teacher. During the team site visit, a recent example was shared about a high school partner that to run a class for concurrent enrollment with a teacher that did not meet Kirtland's teaching qualification requirement. The teacher did not have the HLC-required credentials. Although these decisions can cause a strain on high school partner relations, the College understands its responsibility to uphold compliance with HLC requirements. The following semester, the high school took steps to ensure that a qualified faculty member taught the class so that students could receive credit at both the high school and college level.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.B - Core Component 3.B

The institution offers programs that engage students in collecting, analyzing and communicating information; in mastering modes of intellectual inquiry or creative work; and in developing skills adaptable to changing environments.

1. The general education program is appropriate to the mission, educational offerings and degree levels of the institution. The institution articulates the purposes, content and intended learning outcomes of its undergraduate general education requirements.
2. The program of general education is grounded in a philosophy or framework developed by the institution or adopted from an established framework. It imparts broad knowledge and intellectual concepts to students and develops skills and attitudes that the institution believes every college-educated person should possess.
3. The education offered by the institution recognizes the human and cultural diversity and provides students with growth opportunities and lifelong skills to live and work in a multicultural world.
4. The faculty and students contribute to scholarship, creative work and the discovery of knowledge to the extent appropriate to their offerings and the institution's mission.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland's general education program supports its mission and meets the requirements of the Michigan transfer agreement. As stated in the Kirtland catalog: "The pursuit of general education provides learners with the broad intellectual foundation necessary for continuing growth to achieve their potential and become successful lifelong learners in a changing world. General education provides the common knowledge and skills that enable us to understand one another, interact, collaborate to solve problems, and build an effective community. Kirtland Community College seeks to achieve the aims of general education in three ways: core competencies; general education across the curriculum; and extra-curricular programs and events."

The catalog also includes a statement that mastery of the six core competencies (communication, personal growth/citizenship, technology/information literacy, problem solving, work productivity, systems/processes) "is assessed in all courses" and "is measured and analyzed in the academic assessment process."

Students completing the Associate of Science and Arts program can transfer seamlessly to four-year universities included in the Michigan Transfer Agreement (MTA). The MTA web page shares detailed information about each participating community college, state university and private/independent university in Michigan.

General educational offerings at Kirtland recognize human and cultural diversity. Curricular examples from the Nursing and Business programs were provided. Cocurricular programs such as

study abroad and service learning can provide further growth opportunities to provide students with lifelong skills to live and work in a multicultural world. Recent college efforts to expand service learning and embark on study abroad initiatives were delayed by the pandemic.

Kirtland's 2018 addition of diversity as a stronger theme in the citizenship core competency undergirds the College's understanding of the importance of integrating human and cultural diversity awareness across the curriculum. Kirtland's HLC interim report shared the interactive process that addressed this core component; however the Site Visit Team noted that the current catalog link on the college website does not list the updated version of the personal growth/citizenship competency (with diversity inclusion). The Site Visit Team encourages Kirtland consider an update to its general core competency assessment statement in the catalog to reflect its current direction with regard to assessment processes (more on this in Core Component 4B).

Opportunities for faculty scholarship and discovery of knowledge are available in the form of professional memberships, professional conference participation, and statewide advisory committees. The assurance argument states that some faculty hold patents and/or have published work; it is unclear how recent or often this happens. Student creative contributions are demonstrable in the arts and scholarly/research opportunities are provided in the Nursing and Marketing programs.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.C - Core Component 3.C

The institution has the faculty and staff needed for effective, high-quality programs and student services.

1. The institution strives to ensure that the overall composition of its faculty and staff reflects human diversity as appropriate within its mission and for the constituencies it serves.
2. The institution has sufficient numbers and continuity of faculty members to carry out both the classroom and the non-classroom roles of faculty, including oversight of the curriculum and expectations for student performance, assessment of student learning, and establishment of academic credentials for instructional staff.
3. All instructors are appropriately qualified, including those in dual credit, contractual and consortial offerings.
4. Instructors are evaluated regularly in accordance with established institutional policies and procedures.
5. The institution has processes and resources for assuring that instructors are current in their disciplines and adept in their teaching roles; it supports their professional development.
6. Instructors are accessible for student inquiry.
7. Staff members providing student support services, such as tutoring, financial aid advising, academic advising and cocurricular activities, are appropriately qualified, trained and supported in their professional development.

Rating

Met

Rationale

The Kirtland service area is not ethnically diverse (94% Caucasian) but reflects a socio-economic diversity with a poverty rate of 20%. The site visit team noted that Kirtland faculty and staff displayed sensitivity to the high financial need and first-generation status among many students.

The College has a robust onboarding and evaluation process for full-time faculty, which includes a two-year probationary period. Classroom observations, syllabi review, and Canvas course shell reviews are all professional development expectations during this probationary period. Part-time faculty are evaluated similarly during their first year. Students evaluations are collected at mid-term and at the end of each semester. Mid-term evaluations are shared only with faculty for the purposes of gauging student engagement halfway through the semester. During the HLC review team's campus visit, faculty mentioned examples of how this midterm feedback helped them make adjustments to enhance student engagement during the term. Students responded favorably to the opportunity to share input.

Full-time faculty positions make up just 27% of the faculty at Kirtland (22 full-time and 60 part-time), suggesting that there could be difficulty ensuring a strong faculty presence on institutional teams charged with decisions affecting instruction. However, the full-time faculty are actively engaged in decisions that affect them. A recent re-organization of the Curriculum and Instruction

Committee (CIC) shifted the voting status of staff to "advisory" to allow a stronger faculty voice and vote in all curricular decisions. The site visit team did not see concerns regarding overall out-of-classroom workload for full-time faculty. Because some departments have only one faculty member who is part-time, significant staff support is needed and provided with regard to assessment of learning outcomes.

Documents related to faculty qualifications, contracts and credentials are maintained by Human Resources. An on-site review of twenty faculty files (ten full-time and ten part-time) confirmed that the required credentials had been attained at time of hire.

Instructor availability to students outside of classroom is fluid, with each instructor scheduling their own time. The Faculty Master Agreement shares an expectation that faculty "self-manage a work week to ensure they are carrying out designated responsibilities" which include "reasonable accessibility to students via multiple modalities" but there is no expectation of minimum office hours per week.

Expectations for staff qualifications are appropriate for each role, and the college provides training and professional development to ensure that skills are upgraded as needed. Professional growth development is offered through professional organization memberships and conference participation at the state, regional, and national level.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.D - Core Component 3.D

The institution provides support for student learning and resources for effective teaching.

1. The institution provides student support services suited to the needs of its student populations.
2. The institution provides for learning support and preparatory instruction to address the academic needs of its students. It has a process for directing entering students to courses and programs for which the students are adequately prepared.
3. The institution provides academic advising suited to its offerings and the needs of its students.
4. The institution provides to students and instructors the infrastructure and resources necessary to support effective teaching and learning (technological infrastructure, scientific laboratories, libraries, performance spaces, clinical practice sites and museum collections, as appropriate to the institution's offerings).

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland's student services, including staff and online resources, support students in getting started and preparing for success. Students are required to demonstrate their preparedness for Math and English through several options, including placement testing, ACT/SAT scores, college transcripts or related measures. Adult students who have been out of high school for 10+ years can work informally with their advisor to determine placement; these case-by-case decisions are made in collaboration with faculty.

Academic advising is provided by five advisors and one counselor/advisor. Students are assigned their advisor based on their program of study. In many cases, advisors also serve other roles such as disability services coordinator or Gaylord campus manager. Advising caseloads vary, but all caseloads are below a 350:1 ratio and are adequate to meet students' needs. Guided pathways assist students and advisors in planning and course selection each term. Students are required to meet with their advisors prior to first time enrolling and before their second semester. Advisors have a presence in Canvas through an online advising course in which each student is enrolled. Students who complete the Advising course modules receive a small scholarship.

The site visit team observed a strong rapport and teamwork between advisors and faculty. The GradesFirst platform allows faculty to submit early alerts on students who are struggling academically; advisors also use this platform to document advising sessions and send appointment campaigns to students.

Academic support is available to students outside of classroom. Librarians assist students with research skills, and many classes have "embedded librarians" to help students research and prepare reports within the context of the individual course. Online support is available through Canvas and a "study group" platform (Circle In) allows students to organically connect with peers, form study groups, create flash cards and other learning tools. Online and face-to-face tutoring can be arranged

by request through the Tutoring Center; however, staff have raised concerns about possible unmet student needs related to tutoring.

Kirtland has a history of robust online instruction and support for students, so a lot of the technology infrastructure was already in place for several years before the pandemic hit. IT staff are valued by all members of the College and were praised for their responsiveness during COVID-19. All classrooms are now outfitted to allow simultaneous face-to-face and Zoom instruction, with class sessions recorded for asynchronous viewing as well.

The Grayling Campus is modern and well-suited for student interaction inside and outside the classroom. A Biggby Cafe' is open from 7:30am to 4:30pm Monday-through-Friday, and a separate small cafeteria offers several breakfast, lunch and snack options for students. Occupational CTE labs and practice rooms at the Grayling campus are state-of-the-art.

The College is cognizant of the paucity of affordable housing options for students near the Grayling campus, creating a hardship for students who travel from across and outside the state of Michigan to enroll in some of Kirtland's programs. In the college's 2019-2024 Strategic and Action Plan, the Board of Trustees has set the goal to "identify funding sources for student housing on the Grayling Campus." As part of these funding considerations, the College might want to consider the "human infrastructure" needed to support student housing. Existing staff resources for public safety and other departments may not be sufficient to support the additional demands that accompany the student housing planned on campus.

Overall, Kirtland provided clear evidence the College provides support for effective teaching and student support.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.S - Criterion 3 - Summary

The institution provides quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

Rationale

The evidence indicates that Kirtland ensures quality educational programming regardless of campus location or instructional delivery modality. Adequate technology, equipment and staffing resources exist to sustain this quality.

Academic rigor is consistent with state and national higher education standards, with differentiated learning goals for certificate and degree attainment. Online courses and high school dual credit classes are held to the same standards as campus-based college course offerings. General education offerings align with Michigan state universities in accordance with the Michigan Transfer Agreement.

The College has solid procedures in place for faculty onboarding, evaluation and professional development. Academic Support and Center for Teaching and Learning provide direct support for faculty in course development and online Canvas shell creation. Student services professionals in advising, financial aid, disability services and counseling are dedicated to supporting students in their academic journeys. Informational Technology staff are accessible to faculty and other staff.

Students are at the heart of Kirtland's work. Faculty and staff pride themselves on the collaborative work they do to address student concerns as they arise.

4 - Teaching and Learning: Evaluation and Improvement

The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs, learning environments and support services, and it evaluates their effectiveness for student learning through processes designed to promote continuous improvement.

4.A - Core Component 4.A

The institution ensures the quality of its educational offerings.

1. The institution maintains a practice of regular program reviews and acts upon the findings.
2. The institution evaluates all the credit that it transcripts, including what it awards for experiential learning or other forms of prior learning, or relies on the evaluation of responsible third parties.
3. The institution has policies that ensure the quality of the credit it accepts in transfer.
4. The institution maintains and exercises authority over the prerequisites for courses, rigor of courses, expectations for student learning, access to learning resources, and faculty qualifications for all its programs, including dual credit programs. It ensures that its dual credit courses or programs for high school students are equivalent in learning outcomes and levels of achievement to its higher education curriculum.
5. The institution maintains specialized accreditation for its programs as appropriate to its educational purposes.
6. The institution evaluates the success of its graduates. The institution ensures that the credentials it represents as preparation for advanced study or employment accomplish these purposes. For all programs, the institution looks to indicators it deems appropriate to its mission.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Prior to the 2021-2022 academic year, Kirtland reviewed its programs on an annual basis. The evidence indicates that these annual reviews focused on key performance indicators including enrollment, staffing, degrees conferred, and a number of financial indicators. Annual program reviews are used to determine the viability of Kirtland's programs. Going forward, Kirtland has adopted a 5-year program review cycle. The five-year program reviews will expand the program review process to include more qualitative measures. The qualitative measures planned for the five-year program reviews will be built around three key questions: "where was the program, where is the program, and where does the program want to be?" The answers to these questions will be used to guide program goal setting for the next five years.

On-site conversations confirmed the role of advisory committees in program review and in shaping

program curriculum. Kirtland administrators confirmed that examination of the key performance indicators will continue on an annual basis with the more in-depth review taking place on the five year cycle. Occupational Education reviews include feedback from students, faculty, and advisory committees as required by the Carl Perkins grant. The College acts upon findings from its program review process. For example, Kirtland has used the program review process to suspend programs, such as the Health Information Technology Program, when enrollment fails to support program costs. On-site discussions with program directors and faculty also revealed that Kirtland uses the program review process to revise program curriculum. For example, Kirtland extensively revised the curriculum of its nursing program based upon findings from both program review and assessment of student learning which had revealed a decline in NCLEX exam scores for students completing the nursing program.

Kirtland participates in the Michigan Transfer Initiative, which is governed by the Michigan Transfer Agreement, guides general education, and ensures the transfer of credits between participating institutions. Kirtland's Transfer of Credits policy and procedure governs the transfer of credits and comprehensively addresses the awarding of credits transferred from other institutions of higher learning, advanced placement, CLEP, and other forms of prior learning. The policy ensures the quality of all credits accepted in transfer by Kirtland. Kirtland provides students with detailed guidance regarding the transfer of credits through its website and college catalog.

Kirtland's Curriculum and Instruction Committee maintains authority over course creation, co- and pre-requisites, and course revisions. Kirtland maintains articulation agreements with area high schools and offers dual enrollment courses at the college, online, and on high school campuses. All sections of a particular course must follow a standardized course syllabus and use identical learning outcomes regardless of delivery mode or location. Kirtland's faculty qualifications policy and procedures state that college and dual-credit faculty are required to meet the faculty qualifications set by the Higher Learning Commission.

Most courses for college credit offered on high school campuses are taught by Kirtland faculty. On-site interviews and a review of faculty credentials revealed that Kirtland faculty are appropriately qualified. The College uses Simple Syllabus software to streamline syllabus creation and standardize syllabus content. On-site interviews confirmed the review of syllabi by academic administrators to insure consistency across delivery methods. Kirtland has transitioned to a multiple measures approach for student placement and accelerated paths to college credit for developmental students in order to address requirements passed by the Michigan legislature.

On-site conversations confirmed that the advising center considers appropriate measures for student placement. Advisors work closely with both students and faculty in the placement process. In on-site conversations, advisors and faculty described sample math problems developed by the faculty to aid in student placement. As a part of the advising process, Kirtland leverages the Canvas student online learning module to identify potential issues for students taking classes online. The college provides numerous advising and support services appropriate to its mission and student body.

Kirtland maintains accreditation for its occupational programs including automotive technology, nursing, and surgical technology. A review of the College website and on-site conversations revealed the College's specialized accreditation to be in good standing.

Kirtland evaluates the success of its graduates through the assessment of its Core Competencies. Kirtland's Office of Institutional Research surveys graduates and the results are reviewed by various departments. The College also tracks the transfer of its graduates to universities, and uses reports

from the state's Department of Labor and Economic Opportunity, the Bureau of Labor Market Information, Michigan Works, and the Unemployment Insurance Agency. Kirtland also examines the economic impact of its graduates on the economy in its service area and reports a substantial return on investment for graduates and taxpayers.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

4.B - Core Component 4.B

The institution engages in ongoing assessment of student learning as part of its commitment to the educational outcomes of its students.

1. The institution has effective processes for assessment of student learning and for achievement of learning goals in academic and cocurricular offerings.
2. The institution uses the information gained from assessment to improve student learning.
3. The institution's processes and methodologies to assess student learning reflect good practice, including the substantial participation of faculty, instructional and other relevant staff members.

Rating

Met

Rationale

On-site conversations with Kirtland faculty and administrators revealed that the COVID-19 pandemic significantly impacted faculty workloads, as it became necessary to shift many classes from face-to-face to distance learning during state mandated shut-downs. As faculty worked to navigate the challenges presented by COVID-19, Kirtland paused the College's assessment efforts.

Despite the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, Kirtland has made progress in implementing and revising the assessment plan presented as part of its interim monitoring report. In response to interim monitoring, Kirtland developed a comprehensive process for assessing program and general education (core competency) learning outcomes. Kirtland also developed an Assessment Handbook, conducted a review of program learning outcomes, and added all program learning outcomes to its website. Kirtland's Assessment Handbook states, "Assessment at the course, program, and institutional level is an integral component of higher education. While assessment has always been an important part of academics at Kirtland Community College (KCC), we recognized that there was a need to further develop the assessment process across academic departments and programs." On-site conversations confirm that administration and faculty recognize the value of assessing student learning, the progress made by the college since 2017, the current challenges faced by the college, and the steps needed to comprehensively assess student learning at Kirtland. During on-site conversations, faculty also demonstrated a clear understanding of the relationship between assessment, budgeting, and strategic planning at Kirtland.

Kirtland presented a plan to assess all program outcomes and core competencies on an annual basis in its 2019 interim report to the HLC. On-site conversations revealed that the plan submitted in the interim report had minimal faculty input. Faculty worked to implement the plan as written through an extensive process of tagging assignments in the College's LMS in every course to measure the six core competencies. The faculty reported that tagging every core competency in every class was overly burdensome and not the best approach to improve student learning at the course, program, or institutional levels. Additionally, faculty reported that the requirement to measure all six core competencies in every class was forced in some cases when the course content did not align with the

core competency. Kirtland's Assessment Team is currently focused on building a culture of assessment in which assessment data are used to make meaningful decisions about courses and programs and to assure the quality of Kirtland's educational offerings.

The current instructional leadership, in consultation with faculty, has determined that the approach detailed in the Interim monitoring report is not sustainable. Changes in instructional leadership (a new CAO) at Kirtland after submission of the interim report have facilitated a shift in the assessment process to be faculty driven and sensitive to faculty input. The College has developed a standardized assessment report form with wide faculty support.

During on-site conversations, Kirtland's Assessment Team described the current approach to assessment and plans to revise the approach outlined in the interim report to be sustainable and useful for measuring and improving student learning. Kirtland's assessment efforts at the program and general education (core competency) levels are shifting to a mapping model in which courses map to the learning outcomes relevant to the course rather than all program learning outcomes and core competencies. Faculty will continue to collect data for all program and core competency learning outcomes on an annual basis for some time. The Assessment Team and Vice President of Instructional Services indicated the College intends to move to a rotation model, in which one core competency is assessed each year. The Assessment Team is also working to identify "assessment champions" for each of its programs, but recognized the challenge presented when a program lacks a full-time faculty member.

In the Annual Assessment Report Form Summary 2017-2021, Kirtland provided extensive evidence of assessment at the program level. Evidence was provided for programs including Nursing, Business Management, Entrepreneurship, and Welding. The reports also included program level data from areas within General Education including English, Math, and Science. The reports indicate that assessment data were used to measure learning within the programs and to make changes when warranted by the data. These reports were current through fall 2020 and on-site interviews indicated that analysis of winter 2021 data are underway. Kirtland also provided evidence indicating that substantial data has been collected at the institutional level (core competencies) and on-site conversations indicated a commitment to regularly review these competencies for currency and relevance. Course syllabi provided as evidence indicated that all courses have clearly defined learning outcomes. On-site conversations with faculty indicated that course-level assessment is an ongoing process. Faculty indicated that course learning outcomes are assessed each semester through assignments appropriate to the course and that faculty use the assessment data to measure and improve student learning. In on-site conversations, English faculty described the use of assessment data to revise of the content for English Composition I and II to better fit student needs.

In the interim report, Kirtland defined co-curricular activities as, "purposeful and assessable events that complement the academic program and occur beyond the traditional classroom. Co-curricular activities are developmental, transformative, and future-focused. They are also experiential, offering authentic, hands-on opportunities to hone skills and put ideas into practice. They should develop students' engagement with their communities and their peers and align with the goals of the college's core competencies with some form of measurable outcomes." Due to the impact of COVID-19, Kirtland is in the early stages of co-curricular assessment. The College has experienced a shift toward online learning and has found that student interest in activities outside the classroom has declined. On-site conversations indicated the College is focusing its efforts on service-learning opportunities and plans to assess those activities under the co-curricular umbrella. Kirtland has formed a Service Learning Committee to spearhead these efforts and plans to broaden faculty

engaged by the middle of the fall 2021 semester. The College does recognize the challenge of engaging part-time faculty in promoting service learning opportunities for students. There was also some discussion of “inter-curricular” activities embedded in courses being assessed under the co-curricular umbrella.

The evidence provided suggests that Kirtland’s efforts to assess learning outcomes at the course, program, and institutional (core competency) have largely focused on direct assessments. As the College refines its assessment processes and expands its assessment of student learning to include co-curricular assessment, it may be beneficial to consider indirect assessment measures in addition to the measures currently in use. Additionally, the College’s planned addition of student housing is likely to necessitate additional focus on co-curricular assessment.

During on-site interviews, faculty and administration voiced a commitment to preserving the components identified in the interim report and outlined in the Assessment Handbook, while streamlining the assessment process. The shift from an emphasis on data collection to the use of results and “closing the loop” is well under way. The College has not yet established a timeline for completing this important work but demonstrated a commitment to implementation of the process. The Academic Assessment Plan, included on the Institution Reports and Documents section of the college website, includes an Assessment Timeline that might be useful in guiding the development of a timeline for the current assessment plans.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

4.C - Core Component 4.C

The institution pursues educational improvement through goals and strategies that improve retention, persistence and completion rates in its degree and certificate programs.

1. The institution has defined goals for student retention, persistence and completion that are ambitious, attainable and appropriate to its mission, student populations and educational offerings.
2. The institution collects and analyzes information on student retention, persistence and completion of its programs.
3. The institution uses information on student retention, persistence and completion of programs to make improvements as warranted by the data.
4. The institution's processes and methodologies for collecting and analyzing information on student retention, persistence and completion of programs reflect good practice. (Institutions are not required to use IPEDS definitions in their determination of persistence or completion rates. Institutions are encouraged to choose measures that are suitable to their student populations, but institutions are accountable for the validity of their measures.)

Rating

Met

Rationale

Kirtland is required by the state to track retention and completion/transfer data, and uses the state averages to set targets for enrollment, retention, and graduation rates. The College has set a goal of meeting or exceeding state averages. Kirtland is working to meet its goal through modifications to courses and programs and by providing student supports as part of the MI-BEST initiative. As part of this initiative, there is a particular focus on the economic needs of students. Kirtland has integrated a focus on student success into its 2019-2024 Strategic Plan and on-site conversations indicated a campus wide culture of student support. The most recent complete data, from 2019, show a fall-to-winter persistence rate of 66.76% for Kirtland compared to a 2017 state average of 71%. The most recent completion/transfer data show a 2014 completion rate of 55.64% for Kirtland compared to a 2012 state average of 55%. Between the 2008 6-year cohort and 2014 cohort, completion/transfer increased from 50.38% to 55.64%. Based upon these data, Kirtland appears to have achieved its goal of meeting the state average for completion/transfer. Kirtland's goal of meeting state averages is ambitious, attainable, and appropriate to the College's mission.

Kirtland employs robust data collection processes and measures key metrics such as fall-to-fall retention, fall-to-winter persistence, and completion/transfer. Kirtland's Information Overview Booklet provides a comprehensive analysis of student body demographics including place of residence, age, gender, income, and educational attainment. The College surveys students to examine their intention to persist and their educational goals. The survey results indicated that 85.16%, 81.82%, and 79.15% students intended to enroll the next semester for 2018, 2019, and 2020 surveys, respectively. The actual reported fall to next term persistence rates were 65.85% and 66.67% for

2018 and 2019, respectively. These were reported as part of the Michigan Governor's Metrics Report. An analysis of the factors influencing the gap between students' intention to enroll the next semester compared to the actual enrollment could be a valuable tool for addressing fall-to-winter persistence. Kirtland collects and analyzes other data including IPEDS data, the Voluntary Framework of Accountability, data from the Michigan Center for Educational Performance and Information, the CCSSE, and Perkins Occupational Program Reports. Kirtland's Executive Dashboard of Productivity Measures indicates that the overall number of Associate's Degrees and Certificates conferred was relatively stable between the 15/16 and 19/20 academic years.

Kirtland's Director of Institutional Research prepares comprehensive reports regarding retention, persistence, and completion each semester and the reports are utilized by various groups to improve instruction. On-site conversations revealed a strong commitment to student retention, persistence, and completion across Kirtland's academic programs and departments. Faculty are presented with data from the Director of Institutional Research on an Annual Basis. On-site conversations confirmed that decision making at Kirtland is data driven. Based upon an analysis of student performance in developmental English and math courses, the College revised course content and the developmental pathways. The College uses several products including Rave Alerts and an Early Alert System through Grades First to support student success. On-site conversations confirmed that Kirtland has a well-developed process involving faculty, advisors, and tutors in the use of these tools to promote student success. For example, on-site conversations indicated that the college leverages the Grades First software to facilitate conversations between advisors, instructors, and tutors. Instructors are also able to issue student progress reports on an as-needed basis to alert advisors when students need additional support.

Kirtland has implemented sound practices in collecting and analyzing data on student retention, persistence, and completion. The College tracks a number of measures including fall-to-fall retention, fall-to-winter persistence, completion/transfer, the community college survey of student engagement, the community college faculty survey of student engagement, and IPEDS. The College also prepares annual Program Reviews, which include measures of program completion, on an annual basis. The processes and methodologies used by Kirtland are consistent with requirements from the state of Michigan and well-suited to the College's mission.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

4.S - Criterion 4 - Summary

The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs, learning environments and support services, and it evaluates their effectiveness for student learning through processes designed to promote continuous improvement.

Rationale

Kirtland has worked diligently to maintain responsibility for its educational programs as it has partnered with area public schools. Kirtland uses appropriate program review processes to ensure the viability and currency of its academic offerings. The College employs a variety of approaches to support its students and operates with a “students first” approach. Kirtland has used the results of its program review process, input from advisory boards, and feedback from students to continuously improve its programs. The College has a plan in place to assess student learning at the course, program, and institutional levels. Kirtland has experienced challenges due to the COVID-19 pandemic that have slowed progress in the area of assessment along with a number of transitions that have produced positive shifts in Kirtland's approach to the assessment of student learning. The assessment of co-curricular learning is in the early stages as the college is currently working to redefine its co-curricular learning opportunities with a focus on service learning.

5 - Institutional Effectiveness, Resources and Planning

The institution's resources, structures, processes and planning are sufficient to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its educational offerings, and respond to future challenges and opportunities.

5.A - Core Component 5.A

Through its administrative structures and collaborative processes, the institution's leadership demonstrates that it is effective and enables the institution to fulfill its mission.

1. Shared governance at the institution engages its internal constituencies—including its governing board, administration, faculty, staff and students—through planning, policies and procedures.
2. The institution's administration uses data to reach informed decisions in the best interests of the institution and its constituents.
3. The institution's administration ensures that faculty and, when appropriate, staff and students are involved in setting academic requirements, policy and processes through effective collaborative structures.

Rating

Met

Rationale

The Michigan Community College Acts of 1955 and 1966 established Kirtland Community College as an autonomous, not-for-profit entity. The College is governed by a Board of Trustees comprised of seven elected members representing its taxing districts. The Board has sole responsibility for decision-making at the College but may delegate decisions to others. The Board delegates day-to-day institutional management to the president and expects faculty to oversee academics. The General Duties and Responsibilities of Administrators policy articulate the activities of the president and the president's direct reports.

In the assurance narrative, the College states that it does not have shared governance. During interviews it was revealed this is due to the fact that the College has no faculty senate nor does it have a student senate. However, the spirit of shared governance is evident in several ways but is often referred to as shared decision-making. Standing committees are comprised of administrators, faculty, staff, and sometimes students. During interviews with faculty and staff, there was evidence that employees feel they are asked to contribute ideas and opinions and participate in budgeting, strategic planning, and other idea-generating meetings. Faculty and staff confirmed they are comfortable sharing ideas with supervisors.

College administration uses multiple types of data to guide its decision-making. The College is at the end of a three-phase building project that developed out of in-depth strategic planning efforts. Data

gathered supported the development of a new building rather than reinvesting in older buildings that were less energy-efficient, no longer met the College's needs, and were on multiple sites. Now academic programs are largely located on the Grayling campus with a few technical programs offered at the Gaylord campus.

Kirtland uses program review to guide decision-making. The information provided via the program review process informs administration about student and employer demand for programs that aids in decision-making for expansion of programs or the need to sunset a program due to declining enrollment, licensure requirement changes, etc.

Survey data collected from students guides technology needs for the institution. External data provided from the state regarding career outlook and workforce analysis also provides information for programmatic decisions. These uses of data support the argument that the College is using data to inform decision-making.

College policies provided evidence that faculty are involved in setting academic requirements, policy, and processes via the Curriculum and Instruction Committee (CIC) which is comprised of academic deans, chairs, directors and faculty as well as staff and a student representative. The Board is ultimately responsible for providing oversight and support for the faculty and staff in the setting and monitoring of academic requirements. The president is responsible for implementing directives of the Board. The president delegates implementation of curriculum and academic policy to the CIC. The academic leadership of the College is controlled by administrative positions. Faculty have input via the Curriculum and Instruction Committee.

The College has a slate of policies and procedures that guide its operations. These are shared on the College website and via assorted employee and student handbooks. There is no regular process for reviewing and updating the policies and procedures; they are updated as needed. It was noted in an interview that some employees were surprised by policies that were brought to the Board for approval, finding out about them via the Board agenda. This was noted as an issue that they believe has been resolved.

Overall, Kirtland provided clear evidence that the College has effective administrative processes in place.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

5.B - Core Component 5.B

The institution's resource base supports its educational offerings and its plans for maintaining and strengthening their quality in the future.

1. The institution has qualified and trained operational staff and infrastructure sufficient to support its operations wherever and however programs are delivered.
2. The goals incorporated into the mission and any related statements are realistic in light of the institution's organization, resources and opportunities.
3. The institution has a well-developed process in place for budgeting and for monitoring its finances.
4. The institution's fiscal allocations ensure that its educational purposes are achieved.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Faculty and staff at the College are sufficient to support its operations. During faculty and staff interviews it was apparent that people wear multiple hats at the institution and many faculty are singular in their programs although some have the support of adjuncts. However, the College is small and tight-knit and the interviews revealed that employees feel they are getting adequate resources to support their programs or tasks. Additionally, employees shared that there is a shared culture of employees working together to get things done.

The College had been experiencing declining enrollments causing a decline in tuition revenue. However, early projections indicate an enrollment increase for Fall of 2021. The other two main funding streams, property taxes and state appropriations have remained relatively flat, while expenses have continually increased. The 2019-2020 revenue was:

- State appropriations – 19.7% of budget
- Property taxes – 42.3% of budget
- Tuition & fees – 35.4% of budget
- Other – 2.6% of budget

Kirtland's CFI (including GASB'S) is stable at 3.61 for 2020, 5.34 for 2019, and 5.02 for 2018; and CFI (excluding GASB'S) of -0.27 for 2020, 0.97 for 2019, and -1.43 for 2018. The College planned to address declining enrollments by reducing expenses and by implementing strategies to address the decline such as eliminating low-enrolled programs to reinvest in new programs. Kirtland has processes in place to monitor and adapt to its enrollment, especially in light of early indications that fall 21 enrollment is ahead of projections.

The College supports its mission and operational plans in a realistic manner. This is evidenced by its ability to fund a significant three-phase capital project while maintaining an adequate fund balance. The College shows a commitment to academics as evidenced by the percentage of total operating

expenses spent on instruction and instructional support which was 28% and 16%, respectively, for FY20 (see 2020 Financial Statements).

The College's budget process is a blend of formal and informal practices. Faculty and staff request additional budget via respective department heads. Department heads submit a budget request for the next year. Substantial employee input on the budget is at the budget request phase; the responsibility for setting budget levels is with the administration who then forward a budget to the Board for final approval.

The Board does not have direct influence over individual budget line items but rather guides the priorities of the College by ensuring funding ties to the mission and strategic plan. The Board is involved in development of annual goals via the Operational Plan. The College Administrative Team (CAT) holds an annual retreat where the Operational Plan is developed for the year. The plan then goes to the Board for review where Board priorities/goals may be added to the plan. The Board's priorities are flagged in the operational plan. The Board goals are high-level and typically are tied closer to the mission than the strategic plan. Students do not have involvement with the development of the budget with the exception of student-related information garnered via the student survey that is administered each semester. Students are involved in the strategic planning summit that is held every five years. The last summit was held in September 2019. Much of the budget development is guided by operational plans, and by the master facility and technology plans.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

5.C - Core Component 5.C

The institution engages in systematic and integrated planning and improvement.

1. The institution allocates its resources in alignment with its mission and priorities, including, as applicable, its comprehensive research enterprise, associated institutes and affiliated centers.
2. The institution links its processes for assessment of student learning, evaluation of operations, planning and budgeting.
3. The planning process encompasses the institution as a whole and considers the perspectives of internal and external constituent groups.
4. The institution plans on the basis of a sound understanding of its current capacity, including fluctuations in the institution's sources of revenue and enrollment.
5. Institutional planning anticipates evolving external factors, such as technology advancements, demographic shifts, globalization, the economy and state support.
6. The institution implements its plans to systematically improve its operations and student outcomes.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Systematic planning and improvement are managed at the College in a manner that is integrated across much of the college. Strategic Planning is conducted by administration with involvement of the Board. A Strategic Planning committee was formed of administrators, managers, faculty and staff to focus on long-range planning for the College. The committee holds an annual strategic planning summit to focus on goals and the process of goal attainment. Students are involved in strategic planning summits every five years.

It is clear that all College operations and plans are centered on the College's mission which is "To provide innovative educational opportunities to enhance student lives and build stronger communities." This was evident in the documentation provided as well as by conversations with team members. The Site Visit Team was provided with evidence of planning documents used by the College, which includes the Strategic Plan, Operational Plan, Facilities Master plan, and Technology Plan.

The College provided little evidence, other than student surveys, of evaluation of its operations in order to plan for and make improvements. It is not clear if the College has a formal method for evaluating student services operations such as advising and financial aid. Academic improvements have occurred through the Program Review process as detailed in Core Component 4.A.

Although enrollment had been declining, the College has adjusted for that reality by adjusting its budget and fund balance projections to fit the new enrollment forecast. In addition, the College has been able to bring to near completion a major three-phase capital project. This is clear evidence that the College has a sound understanding of its current capacity.

While the COVID-19 pandemic could hardly be anticipated, the College has remained committed to serving its students by employing a variety of efforts. Access to broadband is a critical issue for students in this area. In response to this, the College invested in Chromebooks, and mobile hotspots to assist students in gaining internet access. HEERF funding was instrumental in funding this effort.

The College is committed to instituting its strategic plan as evidenced by the near completion of its construction project and closure of the Roscommon campus. This project has been a central focus of planning for a number of years. The College is also committed to a philosophy of appreciative inquiry which has been incorporated into the planning processes of the institution and further supports their planning processes.

Overall, Kirtland demonstrated a strong commitment to strategic planning and the implementation of the plan.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

5.S - Criterion 5 - Summary

The institution's resources, structures, processes and planning are sufficient to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its educational offerings, and respond to future challenges and opportunities.

Rationale

Kirtland's leadership effectively manages and guides the institution in fulfilling its mission through a culture of shared decision-making and policy-setting and a through a practice of using data to make informed decisions.

A spirit of shared governance is evidenced through the many ways that faculty and staff are able to share ideas and participate in decision-making and planning. Additional evidence of the spirit of shared governance is the participation of faculty, staff, and students on College committees. While the Board is ultimately responsible for setting College policies, faculty are involved in setting academic requirements, policy, and processes via the Curriculum and Instruction Committee.

Decisions at the College are informed by data, such as data from past operations, program reviews, surveys of students, and external information from the state. The College also uses data to inform its decision-making and strategic and operational planning.

The College has sufficient resources to support its operations and further its mission. While there has been a reduction in employee numbers over the last few years, employees feel supported and have a culture of "pulling together to get the work done." Financially, the College has experienced a decline in tuition revenue and stresses from the pandemic, but has been able to make strategic investments, such as a major capital investment.

The College has an established practice of planning via strategic planning summits and various planning events, operational plans, and other planning such as the Facility Master Plan and the Technology Plan. The College has adopted the philosophy of Appreciative Inquiry which guides them in their planning efforts.

Review Dashboard

Number	Title	Rating
1	Mission	
1.A	Core Component 1.A	Met
1.B	Core Component 1.B	Met
1.C	Core Component 1.C	Met
1.S	Criterion 1 - Summary	
2	Integrity: Ethical and Responsible Conduct	
2.A	Core Component 2.A	Met
2.B	Core Component 2.B	Met
2.C	Core Component 2.C	Met
2.D	Core Component 2.D	Met
2.E	Core Component 2.E	Met
2.S	Criterion 2 - Summary	
3	Teaching and Learning: Quality, Resources and Support	
3.A	Core Component 3.A	Met
3.B	Core Component 3.B	Met
3.C	Core Component 3.C	Met
3.D	Core Component 3.D	Met
3.S	Criterion 3 - Summary	
4	Teaching and Learning: Evaluation and Improvement	
4.A	Core Component 4.A	Met
4.B	Core Component 4.B	Met
4.C	Core Component 4.C	Met
4.S	Criterion 4 - Summary	
5	Institutional Effectiveness, Resources and Planning	
5.A	Core Component 5.A	Met
5.B	Core Component 5.B	Met
5.C	Core Component 5.C	Met
5.S	Criterion 5 - Summary	

Review Summary

Conclusion

Kirtland Community College has provided clear evidence the College plans carefully and thoughtfully, is an integral part of its community, and is committed to student success. Kirtland has also demonstrated its commitment to continuous improvement through assessment processes.

Questions the Site Visit Team had about changes since the 2019 monitoring report was filed were answered completely and provided an example of Kirtland's willingness to examine processes and implement meaningful changes that are sustainable.

Overall Recommendations

Criteria For Accreditation

Met

Sanctions Recommendation

No Sanction

Pathways Recommendation

Not Applicable to This Review

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.



Institutional Status and Requirements Worksheet

INSTITUTION and STATE:	Kirtland Community College, MI
TYPE OF REVIEW:	Standard Pathway Comprehensive Evaluation
DESCRIPTION OF REVIEW:	Year 4 Comprehensive Evaluation. Per the institution's request, this visit will be conducted with the full team visiting the campus in-person.
DATES OF REVIEW:	9/13/2021 - 9/14/2021
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No Change in Institutional Status and Requirements

Accreditation Status

Nature of Institution

Control: Public

Recommended Change: no change

Degrees Awarded: Associates

Recommended Change: no change

Reaffirmation of Accreditation:

Year of Last Reaffirmation of Accreditation: 2017 - 2018

Year of Next Reaffirmation of Accreditation: 2027 - 2028

Recommended Change: no change

Accreditation Stipulations

General:

The institution is approved at the following program level(s): Associate's

The institution is not approved at the following program level(s): Bachelor's, Master's, Specialist, Doctoral

Recommended Change: no change



Institutional Status and Requirements Worksheet

Additional Location:

Prior HLC approval required.

Recommended Change: no change

Distance and Correspondence Courses and Programs:

Approved for distance education courses and programs. The institution has not been approved for correspondence education.

Recommended Change: no change

Accreditation Events

Accreditation Pathway

Standard Pathway

Recommended Change: no change

Upcoming Events

Comprehensive Evaluation: 2027 - 2028

Recommended Change: no change

Monitoring

Upcoming Events

None

Recommended Change: no change

Institutional Data

Educational Programs

Undergraduate

Certificate	17	_____
Associate Degrees	21	_____
Baccalaureate Degrees	0	_____

**Recommended
Change: no
change**



Institutional Status and Requirements Worksheet

Graduate

Master's Degrees	0	_____
Specialist Degrees	0	_____
Doctoral Degrees	0	_____

Extended Operations

Branch Campuses

None

Recommended Change: no change

Additional Locations

Kirtland Community College - Roscommon, 10775 North St. Helen Road, Roscommon, MI, 48653 - Active
 MTEC, 60 Livingston Blvd, Gaylord, MI, 49735 - Active

Recommended Change: no change

Correspondence Education

None

Recommended Change: no change

Distance Delivery

11.0501 - Computer Systems Analysis/Analyst, Certificate, Certificate in Computer Technician
 24.0101 - Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies, Associate, Associate in Business Administration
 24.0103 - Humanities/Humanistic Studies, Associate, Associate in Arts
 51.0707 - Health Information/Medical Records Technology/Technician, Associate, AAS in Health Information Technology
 51.0708 - Medical Transcription/Transcriptionist, Associate, AAS Medical Transcription
 51.0716 - Medical Administrative/Executive Assistant and Medical Secretary, Associate, AAS Medical Secretary
 51.09 - Allied Health Diagnostic, Intervention, and Treatment Professions, Certificate, Certificate in Vascular Sonography
 52.0201 - Business Administration and Management, General, Associate, AAS in Business Management
 52.0201 - Business Administration and Management, General, Certificate, Certificate in Small Business Management and Entrepreneurship
 52.0301 - Accounting, Certificate, Certificate in Bookkeeping

Institutional Status and Requirements Worksheet

52.0401 - Administrative Assistant and Secretarial Science, General, Associate, AAS
Administrative Assistant

52.0701 - Entrepreneurship/Entrepreneurial Studies, Certificate, Certificate in General Business

52.12 - Management Information Systems and Services, Associate, Associate in Computers -
Computer Science

52.1201 - Management Information Systems, General, Associate, Associate in Computers -
Information Systems

Contractual Arrangements

None

Recommended Change: no change

Consortial Arrangements

None

Recommended Change: no change
